



STARK-TUSCARAWAS-WAYNE JOINT SOLID WASTE MANAGEMENT DISTRICT

9918 Wilkshire Blvd NE • Bolivar, OH 44612
330-874-2258 • 800-678-9839 • 330-874-2449 FAX
www.timetorecycle.org • district@timetorecycle.org

David Held
Executive Director

Erica Wright
Finance Director

BOARD OF DIRECTORS MEETING MINUTES

Friday, November 4, 2016 @ 9:30am

1. Roll Call

Chairperson Everett called the meeting to order at 9:30am with the following present:

➤ Board Members:

Belle Everett, Chairperson, Tuscarawas County Commissioner
Chris Abbuhl, Tuscarawas County Commissioner
David Bridenstine, Stark County Commissioner
Sue Smail, Wayne County Commissioner
Scott Wiggam, Wayne County Commissioner
Richard Regula, Stark County Commissioner

➤ Staff Members

Executive Director David Held
Finance Director Erica Wright
Board Secretary Rachel Rothacher
Recycling Coordinator Brett Pendleton

➤ Absent:

Janet Weir Creighton, Stark County Commissioner
Kerry Metzger, Tuscarawas County Commissioner
Ann Obrecht, Vice Chairperson, Wayne County Commissioner

2. Approve Friday, November 4, 2016 Board of Directors Meeting Agenda

- ❖ ***Resolution BOD-2016-41:** Member Abbuhl moved and Member Wiggam seconded a motion to approve the November 4, 2016, Board of Directors meeting agenda. The motion passed unanimously.*

3. Approve Friday, September 2, 2016 Board of Directors Meeting Minutes

- ❖ ***Resolution BOD-2016-42:** Member Smail moved and Member Abbuhl seconded a motion to approve the September 2, 2016, Board of Directors meeting minutes. The motion passed unanimously.*

BOARD of DIRECTORS

Stark
David Bridenstine
Janet Weir Creighton
Richard Regula

Tuscarawas
Chris Abbuhl
Belle Everett
Kerry Metzger

Wayne
Ann Obrecht
Sue Smail
Scott Wiggam

4. Public Speaks

There were no public speaks.

5. Policy Committee Report

- Ohio EPA New Plan Format Comparison
 - The process to complete a new District Plan takes fifteen months.
 - The final Draft Plan is due in March of 2019. The final approval of the Plan should take place in June of 2019.
 - Though the District's current Plan will expire in that time, the District will continue to operate under it until the new one is approved.
 - The District has contracted with GT Environmental to do the District Plan Update and will follow the new Ohio EPA 4.0 format for the Plan rather than the soon-to-be-expired 3.0 format:
 - a) 3.0 has nine chapters; 4.0 has six chapters.
 - b) 3.0 has a 198-page instruction manual; 4.0 has a 407-page instruction manual.
 - c) 3.0 has 9 required data and analyses; 4.0 has 23 required data and analyses.
 - d) 3.0 has 8 appendices; 4.0 has 16 appendices.
- Appendix H Strategic Evaluation Example
 - One single appendix of the new format has 13 in-depth sections.

6. Finance Director's Report

- Estimated Revenue versus Actual Revenue (as of October 31, 2016)
 - Finance Director Erica Wright explained interest earned so far this year is \$29,324.20.
 - Recycling revenue is \$173,467.47 which is down from last year due to lower commingle recycling rates.
 - The \$111.50 in miscellaneous revenue is the BWC rebate program.
 - The total general fund revenue is \$235,688.23 as of October 31, 2016
 - The tipping fee revenue is \$2,948,867.14 which is stable but down about 10% from last year.
 - Total revenue is \$3,184,666.87 which is down slightly from the previous year but right on track with 83% of the projected revenue collected.
- Budgeted versus Actual Expenses (as of October 31, 2016)
 - General fund expenses are at \$151,096.67. Most of that amount was road repairs.
 - Total for administration expenses are at \$667,400.50
 - Total expenses so far this year are at \$3,940,940.13 which is up from last year mostly due to the road repairs, the new City of Canton household hazardous collection program, grants, and nonrecurring one-time expenses.
 - The District does not anticipate spending this amount in the future.
- Current Cash Position (as of October 31, 2016)
 - Started the year with \$6,585,827.76 which is down to \$5,829,554.50
 - The District has overspent by \$756,273.26 in total which will be scaled back for next year.
- Tipping Fee Revenue Update
 - Tipping fee revenue is down by 10% this year as we budgeted \$3,615,000.00 for the year, but it will probably be closer to \$3,300,000 for the year.
- September 30, 2016 Investment Report
 - Total current fund balance is at \$6,064,972.45, which is down from \$7,039,927.62 last year.
 - Interest earned is up to \$29,324.20, which is more than double last year's amount of \$12,153.50 as the rate is up to .811% instead of .685%. The increase occurred after moving money over to the Red Tree Investment account, which is a higher yielding account.

➤ Tipping Fee Revenue Trend

- The tipping fee revenue collected since 1994 peaked in 2004 with \$6,200,936 and dropped by 56% in 2010 to an amount of \$2,723,316.
- Factors impacting the decrease in revenue are due to the economy, changes in waste disposal contracts and fee schedules, and waste company mergers and acquisitions. Examples include when Countywide Landfill lost a Cleveland waste hauler, the merger of Allied and Republic, and Lorain County Solid Waste Management District's tipping fee decrease.
- The District is at the bottom floor with the tipping fees set as follows: In-District \$1.00 per ton, Out-Of-District \$2.00 per ton, and Out-Of-State \$1.00 per ton.
- If the District tipping fees were to be raised, it would have to be approved in the next District Plan, and in-district and out-of-state would have to match due to Interstate Commerce laws.
- When the tipping fees were low, the District had to cut many programs, which have now been re-introduced, but the District strives to manage the programs in the most streamlined way possible.

➤ Historical Financial Trends

- The District operated under an Ohio EPA Plan from 2007 through 2010 which was a more expensive Plan because expenditures were set by the Ohio EPA and included expenditures for the City of Canton curbside program at \$833,000 and the capping of the Newcomerstown Landfill.
- The District expenses dropped by \$4,069,431 or 50% from 2008 to 2015 after coming out from under the Ohio EPA Plan.
- The District fund balance increased by \$3,187,304 or 48% from 2010 until 2015 after the District adopted its own Plan. The District decided to bring back some grant programs like the Program Startup and Recycling and Composting Infrastructure Enhancement and to reintroduce the Household Hazardous Waste Collection and Yard Waste Management Programs.
- Moving forward the District will monitor the revenue and expenses to make sure that the amounts are in alignment.
- It is a goal of the District to have a fund balance with one year's worth of revenue to provide a carryover to cover for any revenue shortages throughout the year.

➤ Other Finance Items

- Scrap tire appropriation line item would have to increase by \$10,000 to cover the rate increase in scrap tire fees from Black Bounce and Liberty Tire.

❖ ***Resolution BOD-2016-43:*** Member Bridenstine moved and Member Abbuhl seconded a motion to transfer \$10,000 from Admin-2 Supplies & Administrative Expenses into STW-06 Scrap Tire Collection in the Tipping Fee Fund to cover increased scrap tire disposal fees. The motion passed unanimously.

- The District has been hoping for several years to get an electronic scanning document management system, but it is expensive and must be able to integrate with our current financial system:
 - a) The system in question is available through CMI, which supplies the District's finance and payroll software programs.
 - b) The system would accept scanned copies and catalog them, and the proposed cost would include the necessary high-quality scanners.
 - c) Also, the District server is six years old, and servers should typically be replaced every 6-8 years. A new server would be useful with the new document management system because more memory will be needed to store the documents.

- d) The finance software used by the District also has a newer version (the current version is nine years old). The newer version would require the new server as well if we move toward it in the future.

❖ ***Resolution BOD-2016-44:*** *Member Regula moved and Member Smail seconded a motion to transfer \$5,000 from Admin-8 Financial Consulting and \$25,000 from STW-28 Well Monitoring Grants for a total of \$30,000 into Admin-3 Capital Assets in the Tipping Fee Fund for the purchase of an electronic scanning document management system and replacement of the network server. The motion passed unanimously.*

7. Executive Director's Report

- District Public Records Retention / Destruction Schedule
- The District strives to destroy items scheduled for destruction per the records retention schedule.
 - The items being destroyed are ones that the District is not required to keep.
 - The District must submit a certificate of records disposal (RC-3) form to the Ohio History Connection for any noted documents.
 - The scheduled destruction date is December 1, 2016.
- Household Hazardous Waste Collection
- When revenue severely decreased in 2010, the District discontinued yard waste and household hazardous waste collection. The contracted yard waste company agreed to keep collecting at no cost. Now that the demand for yard waste has decreased, some local companies have gone out of business so the cost for yard waste collection is higher.
 - The District previously spent close to \$900,000 a year on household hazardous waste collection.
 - 70% of the volume of collected materials was paint and e-waste, and the paint was solidified and landfilled because it is not hazardous.
 - When collection events were discontinued, the District opted to produce a guide to direct residents to other options, but there were no options for pesticides, mercury, etc.
 - This year, the District opened a permanent household hazardous waste collection site at the City of Canton Recycle Center, which is available to all District residents by appointment.
 - The District also partnered with Buehler's Fresh Foods for the last 2016 recycling collection event in New Philadelphia on October 8, 2016, and saw a great turnout. Buehler's supplied most of the workers, the District supplied a few of its own staff, and community service workers were also brought in by the Sheriff's Department. Total cost for the event will likely be less than \$15,000 (still waiting on final invoice).
 - The District and Buehler's plan to accept household hazardous waste at both Tuscarawas and Wayne County events in 2017.
 - The District believes the overall collection program will cost around \$300,000, but if the expenses start to approach that amount, the City of Canton Recycle can stop taking appointments and waste can be collected at only one Buehler's event per county instead of two.
- Household Hazardous Waste Historical Costs
- From 1998-2009, the District hosted four 3-day collection events: two in Stark County, one in Tuscarawas County at Buckeye Career Center, and one in Wayne County at the Orrville airport.
 - The highest single-year vehicle count was 15,000 in 2008.
 - The cost for this program was nearly a million dollars as the program grew.
 - When the collection events were discontinued, the District attempted a pilot program where residents paid \$25 a vehicle, but it had poor participation.

- The three years following the pilot program, the District offered the recycling and reuse guide and the household hazardous waste education grants to lower expenses.
- This year, the District is still offering those options but is collecting as well, so \$300,000 should be enough to offer the collection program if the intake is managed and control measures are put in place and still offer the other options in 2017.

8. Budget Committee Report

➤ STW-24- Host Community Cleanup Grants

- ❖ ***Resolution BOD-2016-45:*** Member Abbuhl moved and Member Wiggam seconded a motion to approve a Recycling Host Community Cleanup Grant for \$625 to the City of New Philadelphia. The motion passed unanimously.

➤ Purchase District Recycling Truck (not to exceed \$260,000)

- The District will likely ask to trade in an older truck when it purchases the new one. Once the trucks approach 200,000 miles and due to the nature of the recycling drop-off site collections with a lot of start-and-stops, the maintenance costs increase.

- ❖ ***Resolution BOD-2016-46:*** Member Wiggam moved and Member Bridenstine seconded a motion to approve the purchase of a new recycling truck, not to exceed \$260,000, to come out of line item STW-02 Drop-Off Recycling Non-Payroll Expenses. The motion passed unanimously.

- ❖ ***Resolution BOD-2016-47:*** Member Regula moved and Member Wiggam seconded a motion to transfer \$110,000 from STW-05 HHW Program, \$100,000 from STW-29 Education Non-Payroll Expenses, and \$50,000 from STW-38 Disaster Debris Management for a total of \$260,000 into STW-02 Drop-off Recycling Non-Payroll Expenses within the Tipping Fee Fund. The motion passed unanimously.

➤ 2017 Appropriation Budget

- The District has a budget set forth in the Plan, but it must project ten years out so not all budgeted amounts align with current program needs.
- There are several items the District will likely not expend but that shouldn't be taken out:
 - a) The nonpayroll expenses presented included the new recycling truck just approved by the board, so that free ups \$250,000. The money could always be moved later if needed so no action is needed.
 - b) The Recycling and Composting Infrastructure Enhancement Grants are an incentive to ensure the District has a place to take items collected. The District doesn't intend to spend this next year because the companies the District is contracted with are already receiving a lot, but the grants will stay in the budget per our Plan.
 - c) Also, the solid waste inspections and well monitoring Health Department Grants will most likely not be expended, but they conform with Plan so they will be budgeted.
- The District will be reviewing the yard waste management program in 2017:
 - a) The Plan budget for the program is \$0 because there was no cost for this program at the time it was made.
 - b) The District's currently contracted company for the Stark County Program presented a new proposal for 2017 which doubled the price, but the District negotiated to finish out the last year of the contract under the same terms. Also, per the 2016 Composting Infrastructure Enhancement Grant agreement awarded to the company, the District could take back the equipment purchased using grant funding.

November 4, 2016, Board of Directors Meeting Minutes cont.

- c) The Wayne County yard waste program is no cost and is lower volume because residents transport directly to the sites.
 - d) The Tuscarawas County yard waste program is lower volume and has fewer sites.
 - e) The Tuscarawas County program's contracted company, Bull Country Compost, receives almost double the rate for those sites, but it didn't set up the site locations and some are very far from its facility.
 - f) In Stark County, the District would like to reduce the number of sites to four or five and direct residents to private sector companies instead including Earth N Wood. Some other private companies will not be able to handle the volume.
 - g) The District would like to allocate \$415,000 for the program next year but will be working toward reducing the sites and streamlining the process.
 - h) The District's goal would be for the program budget to be \$200,000 by 2018, but it will need to transition to this and it takes time when services are being cut.
- The District budgeted \$100,000 in the Plan for Household Hazardous Waste, and last year \$435,000 was appropriated but wasn't nearly spent. The District is confident the permanent site and collection events can be maintained in 2017 for \$300,000 or less.

❖ **Resolution BOD-2016-48:** *Member Regula moved and Member Wiggam seconded a motion to approve the 2017 District Appropriation Budget as presented. The motion passed unanimously.*

➤ 2017 Recycling Makes Sense, Sheriff Department, and Health Department Grants

- Recycling Makes Sense grant payment rates depend on if the community is collecting recycling every week or every other and several other factors.
- The Sheriff Department Grants fund one deputy in each county. The deputy handles illegal dumping cases, dumping issues at recycling drop-off sites, and anything else related to dumping or littering.
- The Health Department Grants fund sanitarians who inspect landfills and other waste facilities. The District funds one sanitarian per landfill and extends a grant to the City of Canton Health Department because they do air permits for Ohio EPA and the Wayne County Health Department because they do inspections at waste facilities but no longer have a landfill.

➤ 2017 Host Community Cleanup Grants

- At our recycling drop-off sites, residents dump garbage, mattresses, furniture, and more, so the District offers grant funding to the site hosts to help keep the sites clean.

❖ **Resolution BOD-2016-49:** *Member Wiggam moved and Member Abbuhl seconded a motion to approve the 2017 Recycling Makes Sense, Sheriff Department, Health Department, and Host Community Cleanup grants as presented. The motion passed unanimously.*

➤ 2017 Legal Counsel

- The District has been contracting with Kristin Zemis for the past few years and would like to continue. The expenses are much lower than they were in 2013.

❖ **Resolution BOD-2016-50:** *Member Wiggam moved and Member Bridenstine seconded a motion to contract with Kristin Zemis as general legal counsel for 2017 at a rate of \$150 per hour and to contract with other legal counsel on an as-needed basis not to exceed \$10,000 for the year. The motion passed unanimously.*

9. Other Business

- The District would like to thank Commissioner Wiggam for his twelve years of service.
- The District would also like to thank Commissioner Bridenstine for finishing out former Commissioner Bernabei's term when he became mayor.
- The District wished luck to all of those running for re-election on Tuesday.

10. Adjournment

- ❖ **Resolution BOD-2016-51:** *Member Regula moved and Member Wiggam seconded a motion to adjourn the meeting at 10:38am. The motion passed unanimously.*



1-6-17

Rachel Rothacher, Administrative Director

Date