



STARK-TUSCARAWAS-WAYNE JOINT SOLID WASTE MANAGEMENT DISTRICT

9918 Wilkshire Blvd NE • Bolivar, OH 44612
330-874-2258 • 800-678-9839 • 330-874-2449 FAX
www.timetorecycle.org • district@timetorecycle.org

David Held
Executive Director

Erica Wright
Finance Director

BOARD OF DIRECTORS MEETING MINUTES

Friday, March 4, 2016 @ 9:30am

Roll Call

Chairperson Everett called the meeting to order at 9:31am with Members Abbuhl, Bridenstine, Carmichael, Creighton, Obrecht, Regula, and Wiggam present. District staff members present were David Held, Erica Wright, Rachel Rothacher, and Brett Pendleton.

Approve March 4, 2016 Board of Directors Meeting Agenda

Member Wiggam moved and Member Creighton seconded a motion to approve the March 4, 2016, Board of Directors meeting agenda. The motion passed unanimously.

Approve January 8, 2016 Board of Directors Meeting Minutes

Member Abbuhl moved and Member Carmichael seconded a motion to approve the January 8, 2016, Board of Directors meeting minutes. The motion passed unanimously.

Public Speaks

There were no public speaks, but Member Regula congratulated Tim Vandersall for his re-election to the Stark County Board of Health.

Policy Committee Report

Executive Director Held presented the Policy Committee Vacancies slide. He shared that Stark County's industrial seat is still vacant and a representative from TimkenSteel or Republic Steel could be sought out because the drug burns are done at those locations. He also said that Wayne County's industrial seat is also still vacant but the District was able to fill Tuscarawas County's industrial vacancy. He added that the Policy Committee won't meet again until after the summer and anyone associated with industry including an owner or employee could be considered for the industrial seat vacancies. Member Obrecht asked if a representative from Buehler's had already been suggested and Held said they are considered commercial.

Executive Director Held presented the Ohio EPA New Plan Format Comparison slide. He said that the District updates its Plan every three years instead of the five-year update schedule other Solid Waste Districts follow because it is easier to get in agreement with the Board and Policy Committee and it is also easier to get support and cooperation with the EPA because the District is more on top of programs and can make modifications due to the dynamic nature of the recycling industry. He shared that the Ohio EPA reduced the number of chapters to make it easier for the public to read, but now there are more deliverable documents and appendices for the District to complete.

BOARD of DIRECTORS

Stark
David Bridenstine
Janet Weir Creighton
Richard Regula

Tuscarawas
Chris Abbuhl
Belle Everett
Kerry Metzger

Wayne
Jim Carmichael
Ann Obrecht
Scott Wiggam

Executive Director Held presented the Appendix H Strategic Evaluation Example slide and said it is an example of some of the changes. Member Regula asked who would be writing the Plan. Held shares that GT Environmental has done it in the past, and the Ohio EPA has a list of three companies that have completed Plans for Solid Waste District—one company in the state and two outside of state. Member Obrecht said it looks like the content of the example appendix (H) is spelled out in the current plan and is not in the appendix. Held said the District was hoping its current Plan could be pasted into the new format because the original Plan was written by the Ohio EPA, but it will be more in depth. He added that the District may be permitted to still complete the 3.0 format, but the Ohio EPA may mandate the use of the 4.0 format, which is not finalized yet.

Personnel Committee Report

Chairperson Everett presented the Personnel Committee Meeting slide and said the Committee met with Executive Director Held and Finance Director Erica Wright to complete their evaluations. She shared that both employees received great marks on their evaluations and added that Held's strength is his great communication skills with not only the Board but also the Policy Committee and District's 108 Political Subdivisions and Wright's strengths are her consistency and ability to provide excellent accounting and auditing. Everett also shared that the Committee recommended that since the staff was down the District should seek outside contracting services when possible so Wright can keep focused on the work that is her responsibility and not get overloaded with work that isn't her responsibility. Member Creighton added that she encourages employees to bring suggestions, challenges, comments and concerns to the Committee's attention so it can provide guidance.

Finance Director's Report

Finance Director Wright presented the Estimated Revenue vs. Actual Revenue slide and said the revenues pretty much in align with last year. She shared that she did not budget as much for recycling revenues this year because the contract with S. Slesnick Company for paper products went from the District receiving \$50/ton to \$30/ton and the new contract with Kimble Recycling and Disposal changed from a fixed rate of \$15/ton for commingled recyclables to a variable rate based on market values of commodities where the District can either pay for the processing of the commodity if the value is low or receive payment for commodities with high value. Wright said that the District had received only one bill so far and the rate was \$19/ton to be paid to Kimble's. She added that the percent collected on the slide will not stay as high as shown because the figures included the December 2015 payment from Kimble's which was based on the previous rate. Member Everett shared that Executive Director Held had told her that the paper tonnages were low now because of the increase in lighter shipping boxes. Held confirmed this and said that China is the biggest buyer and their economy is struggling right now (it is currently less expensive to make virgin plastic). He added that the paper volume is dropping because people are reading less newspapers, but the cardboard volume is going up because of people purchasing more items online, so overall the volume/number of pickups is going up but weight is going down.

Finance Director Wright presented the Budgeted vs. Actual Expenses slide. She shared that most of the expenses under the HHW Program were due to the Recycling and Reuse Guide but a portion also went toward the Wayne Soil and Water Conservation District's HHW Education Grant and the removal of some televisions from the City of Canton Recycling Center. She also that the expenses were less than those from this time last year because of the purchase of an additional recycling truck. She added that the expenses are in alignment with the budget and that it is typical for more to be spent earlier in the year because many of the grants are frontloaded but then level off as the year goes on.

Finance Director Wright presented the Current Cash Position slide and said so far we are at a net loss but that will level out the rest of the year.

Finance Director Wright presented the Tipping Fee Revenue Trend slide and said that since the District had received only January's fees she didn't include her typical tipping fee update slide. She shared examples of some of the factors that impact waste tonnages: when the economy isn't good, waste decreases and there was a recession in 2008-2009; in 2009 Cleveland was taking their waste to Countywide Landfill but the the contract was awarded to someone else; also around that time Allied merged with Republic so in that merger they had to sell off a landfill and transfer station, which allowed waste haulers from outside the District to buy up some of those assets and gain more business in Northeast Ohio; and Lorain County reduced their fees to attract companies to drop off waste at their landfills. Wright added that there were no indications that the tipping fees would go significantly up or down this year and that the biggest variable with the amount of waste received is out-of-district waste, which right now seems to be pretty stable.

Finance Director Wright presented the 2016 Official Certificate of Estimated Resources slide, thanked Member Bridenstine for identifying an error on the sheet and said she distributed a corrected version. She shared that the District is only appropriating half of what is available, which is a very good spot to be in, and all of the amounts are conservative based on prior activity. Wright entertained a motion to approve the 2016 Official Certificate of Estimated Resources as presented retroactive to January 1, 2016. Member Wiggam moved and Member Obrecht seconded the motion as read. Member Creighton asked if this is late this year. Finance Director Wright said she always does the Certificate in March because she never has all of end-of-year balance by the January meeting. She added that most governments have to file with the county auditor but not solid waste districts. The motion passed unanimously.

Executive Director's Report

Executive Director Held presented the Zero Waste Pancake Breakfast slide and said that this was the first time this event was zero waste. He added that the District usually doesn't seek out these types of events for funding but waits until the event organizers approach the District because it shows they have the initiative. Member Obrecht said she never saw this event promoted in the paper and said the District should promote these types of events and let the residents know of the support received. Executive Director Held agreed and said that in this case the event organizer contacted the District right before the event was going to take place but said if they apply for funding again next year and it is earlier enough, the District could promote. Member Obrecht said it is the District's responsibility to send out a news release. Member Regula asked if the District could offer this type of support to other organizations who hold pancake breakfasts, and Member Abbuhl added that the Lions organization holds a pancake breakfast every year and they might benefit from this. Executive Director Held said the District would consider supporting any zero waste event. He added that when there were more staff members they would go out and generate these types of events, but historically what is observed is that when it is the District's idea, the follow through on the event is very weak, but when it is an existing event organizer's idea and they approach the District, the follow through excellent. He stressed that it is not the District's intention to run their events but rather to provide support, guidance, and promotion. Member Obrecht commented that most organizers would jump on board if they knew their paper products would be free. Executive Director Held said similar to when someone wants to do an e-waste collection, the challenge is coordinating where to take the waste. The event organizers are well-intentioned but aren't aware of how much goes into these collection events. Chairperson Everett suggests sending event organizers to Rural Action as well because they push for zero waste. Member Obrecht asked what the limit is for the mini-grant program in case the word really gets out about these events. Executive Director Held answered the District has \$20 000 in the line item and the maximum amount of funding per education mini-grant is \$1,500 or \$2,500 if it is a general mini-grant. He added that the District started the mini-grant program because of events like this.

March 4, 2016, Board of Directors Meeting Minutes cont.

Executive Director Held presented the Green Up Clean Up Program slide and shared how the Stark Metropolitan Housing Authority worked with the City of Canton to bring recycling to residents in their housing developments. Member Wiggam asked why the City of Canton didn't have this set up before and asked if the developments are in the city limits. Executive Director Held confirmed this and said the Authority just recently reached out about adding curbside services. He added that the District wasn't going to run the program so he put them in touch with the City of Canton Sanitation Department and they agreed to work with them.

Executive Director Held presented the 2015 Annual District Report slide. He said that contracting the report out is a great service because the District is required to survey all of the commercial and industrial companies even though they are not required to respond.

Executive Director Held presented the District Vehicle Consolidation slide. Chairperson Everett said she contacted the Tuscarawas County Auditor and they said they are in need of a vehicle. Chairperson Everett entertained a motion to donate the 2005 Ford Explorer to the Tuscarawas County Commissioners. Member Carmichael moved and Member Abbuhl approved the motion as read. The motion passed unanimously.

Executive Director Held presented the STW-5 Household Hazardous Waste Collection Program slide and shared that the City of Canton Recycling Center, which is run by the Health Department, has been great partner to the District because they collect tires, televisions, appliances, and more. He said that the reason they are backed up with televisions is because they were dismantling the televisions themselves but it is a very time and labor intensive process and with the markets down they can't find a processor to accept the plastics. The City recently received notice that a neighborhood meeting determined the residents want the televisions removed, so the City contacted the District for assistance. Held added that the District is working with a Perry Township vendor who recycles everything but the glass tubes and the District has been unable to locate anyone in the United States who can recycle the tubes but the Ohio EPA confirmed that tubes from residents' televisions may be discarded in the trash. Member Obrecht confirmed that the District would be spending \$22,000 to dispose of the televisions at the site. Executive Director Held confirmed this and said that the District is still mandated to run recycling programs whether it receives revenue or has to pay. He added that depending on the markets sometimes it is less expensive to throw recyclables in the trash and that the big challenge is when commodity markets are up everyone becomes a recycler but they stop recycling when the markets are down. Held said the main question with the televisions is whether the District should keep the program going and have consistency or collect one year and not the next. Member Obrecht asked if the District would pay for television disposal if Wayne County hosted an event that would collect them. Executive Director Held confirmed this and said that the District did pay for a collection in Tuscarawas County last year. Chairperson Everett asked audience member Tom Farbizo with Speedie Recycling how much it is to drop off a television at his company. Mr. Farbizo said he does not know but could find out because he knows that they have collected a few and Chairperson Everett said it might be worth looking into. Held shared that the flat screen televisions have value but not the CRT televisions. An audience member said one thing to watch for is when the District used to host HHW collections residents from outside of the District would come because there was no cost and they wanted to take advantage. Member Wiggam said we don't want to make the District the dumping ground for the rest of the state and added that it might be worth developing a contract with certain companies to take control of the situation so that the District could assist them until the markets improve. He added that it was his understanding that you have to pay to dispose of certain items like CRT televisions. Executive Director Held asked if the District should pay for the televisions or charge the residents if it is collecting tipping fees to manage the programs. Member Wiggam said it would be best if each county had a place where residents could take televisions because then the District could take control and have checks in place instead of just disposing of

stacks of televisions, which could get out of control. Executive Director Held agreed and said the City of Canton has been a good partner. He also said that in the future the District would be interested in having at least one location for items like mercury, light bulbs, etc. if it was something the Board would want to explore. Member Regula asked if the District audits the vendor that is accepting the televisions to make sure he is not just disposing them at the landfill. Executive Director Held confirmed this and said there is a mutual interest because it costs him more to throw away the televisions than to sell the recyclable materials.

Review 2016 District Grants

Executive Director Held presented the STW-22 Program Startup Grants slides and said the District doesn't receive many requests for the curbside and pay-as-you-throw programs. He then shared examples of things the District has paid for including capital improvements like fencing, paving, and signs as well as new tires for a loader because they receive a lot of wear at the yard waste sites. He added that the District has not paid for staff or big equipment like caterpillars but it did grant the request for the Jackson Township Recycling Station to receive a forklift because they are the highest volume drop-off in the District. Held said if the District started funding whole front end loaders and they received requests from all of the Stark County yard waste sites, it would total 1.2 million dollars. He shared that applicants may still apply for funding, but if they say the District must pay for a loader or they will end the program, then they can end their program if they choose. He added that the District has pretty stable criteria that it uses to determine who should receive funding. Member Obrecht asked if the Commissioners have only until mid-April to reach out to their subdivisions to encourage them to apply. Executive Director Held confirmed this and said that the District contacted all of the applicants on the list and any others with a yard waste or recycling drop off. He added that those with a combined yard waste and recycling drop off are higher up on the list. Audience member Tom Farbizo asked how the District verifies if a tire needs replaced. Executive Director Held answered that the District doesn't go out and inspect them but relies on the applicant's honesty. Member Wiggam added that you also can't verify if the loader is even used on the yard waste program the majority of the time. Executive Director Held said that the subdivisions do use the loader on a daily basis if they have a yard waste site but said they also use it for salt and other purposes.

Executive Director Held presented the Recycling and Composting Infrastructure Enhancement Grants slides and said the District sent notification of the grants to the companies that currently work closely with the District (Kimbles, Slesnicks., Earth N Wood, Bull Country Compost) to ensure that there is a place to take the material.

Executive Director Held presented the Host Community Cleanup Grants slide and said there were costs associated with keeping the District recycling and yard waste drop off sites clean. Member Wiggam asked if installing fencing and cameras would help solve the contamination problems. Executive Director Held confirmed this. Member Wiggam said that's what the Program Startup grant funding should be used for. Executive Director Held agreed. Chairperson Everett entertained a motion to approve Tuscarawas Township (Stark County) for a 2016 Host Community Cleanup Grant for \$2,500 retroactive to January 1, 2016. Member Regula moved and Member Bridenstine seconded the motion as read. The motion passed unanimously.

Executive Director Held presented the Recycling Makes Sense Grants slide and said there are certain requirements the applicants must meet to receive the additional funding (collecting a certain number of items, collecting once a week, collecting a certain number of pounds per resident). Member Obrecht asked when they receive their payments. Executive Director Held answered they receive quarterly payments. Member Obrecht asked if a news release was distributed announcing this. Executive Director Held answered that nothing was sent out yet but could be. Member Obrecht said the District needs to make sure residents know the District is

March 4, 2016, Board of Directors Meeting Minutes cont.

subsidizing their curbside recycling programs. Executive Director Held agreed and said the District tries to promote these items but asks if the Commissioners would be willing to help distribute. Member Obrecht said if the District sent a release to the Commissioners then they could distribute in their respective county and Chairperson Everett agreed and said residents need to know this money is going back to their communities. Held added that the Commissioners may have more influence getting the message out.

Executive Director Held presented the Stark County Habitat ReStore / OEPA Community Development Grant slide and said this funding does not come from the District but it comes from the Ohio EPA and the District administers the funding. Chairperson Everett entertained a motion to endorse the Habitat for Humanity East Central Ohio application to the OEPA and agree to administer any grant funding awarded by OEPA for this project retroactive to January 28, 2016. Member Creighton moved and Member Abbuhl seconded the motion as read. The motion passed unanimously.

Review 2016 Drug Take Back Program

Executive Director Held presented the Drug Take Back Program slides and said this is the fastest growing program in the District. Member Obrecht asked how the District will not collect the bottles—would it ask residents to take out of the bottle at the site or would the collection agency empty the bottles. Executive Director Held shared in the southern part of the state the residents take the bottles with them after emptying the contents into the collection box and said that probably 60-70% of volume is the packaging. He added that the District is paying for the incineration of the drugs collected by Medway (Wayne County) and that includes the bottles. He also said it might be a difficult transition to get residents used to not leaving the bottles. Chairperson Everett asked if explaining the new process to the residents was something the Education Specialist or Executive Director could do. Held confirmed this. Member Regula asked if the District was still looking into getting its own incinerator. Executive Director Held confirmed this but said that he looked into the incinerator the Stark County Sheriff has but it is too small. Member Obrecht said the District should look into the cost of a larger one. Member Abbuhl asked if the incinerator would have to be located at the Sheriff's Department because of the narcotics. Executive Director Held confirmed this and said that there is a chain of custody when dealing with the drugs collected and a deputy/pharmacist has to watch the drugs the whole time until they are burned.

Review 2016 Earth Day Events

Executive Director Held presented the 2016 Earth Day Event slides and said that these organizations approached the District—the District doesn't go out and seek them out or promote. He added that the Tusky Valley Community Day turned into a big event because it was driven by the school superintendent.

Other Business

There was no other business.

Adjournment

Member Regula moved and Member Creighton seconded a motion to adjourn. The motion passed unanimously. The meeting adjourned at 10:42am.



Rachel Rothacher, Administrative Director

5-6-16

Date