



STARK-TUSCARAWAS-WAYNE JOINT SOLID WASTE MANAGEMENT DISTRICT

9918 Wilkshire Blvd NE • Bolivar, OH 44612
330-874-2258 • 800-678-9839 • 330-874-2449 FAX
www.timetorecycle.org • district@timetorecycle.org

David Held Erica Wright
Executive Director Finance Director

BOARD OF DIRECTORS MEETING MINUTES

Friday, March 3, 2017 @ 9:30am

1. Roll Call

Chairperson Obrecht called the meeting to order at 9:30am with the following present:

➤ **Board Members:**

Ann Obrecht, Chairperson, Wayne County Commissioner
Janet Weir Creighton, Vice Chairperson, Stark County Commissioner
Chris Abbuhl, Tuscarawas County Commissioner
Ron Amstutz, Wayne County Commissioner
Kerry Metzger, Tuscarawas County Commissioner
Richard Regula, Stark County Commissioner
Joe Sciarretti, Tuscarawas County Commissioner
Sue Smail, Wayne County Commissioner
Bill Smith, Stark County Commissioner

➤ **Staff Members**

Executive Director David Held
Finance Director Erica Wright
Board Secretary Rachel Rothacher

➤ **Absent:**

None.

2. Approve Friday, March 3, 2017 Board of Directors Meeting Agenda

- ❖ **Resolution BOD-2017-08:** *Member Creighton moved and Member Abbuhl seconded a motion to approve the March 3, 2017, Board of Directors meeting agenda. The motion passed unanimously.*

3. Approve Friday, January 6, 2017 Board of Directors Meeting Minutes

- ❖ **Resolution BOD-2017-09:** *Member Smail moved and Member Abbuhl seconded a motion to approve the January 6, 2017, Board of Directors meeting minutes. The motion passed unanimously.*

BOARD of DIRECTORS

<i>Stark</i>	<i>Tuscarawas</i>	<i>Wayne</i>
Janet Weir Creighton	Chris Abbuhl	Ron Amstutz
Richard Regula	Kerry Metzger	Ann Obrecht
Bill Smith	Joe Sciarretti	Sue Smail

4. Public Speaks

There were no public speaks.

5. Policy Committee Report

- 2017 Policy Committee Meeting Dates
 - Friday, June 16, 2017 @ 9:30am
 - Friday, August 18, 2017 @ 9:30am
 - Friday, September 15, 2017 @ 9:30am
 - Friday, December 15, 2017 @ 9:30am
- Total District Yard Waste Expenses (2008-2018 Projection)
 - The value of yard waste material increased, so the District ran the program for low to no cost from 2010-2014. Then when the value decreased, the District started paying again but made some changes to the program.
 - District will be reviewing program cost efficiency and effectiveness in 2017 because expenses are projected to double. The program would need to be around \$300,000 annually to manage.
 - District will be exploring options including the possibility of awarding block grants to host the sites or reducing the number of sites, but changes would not be implemented until next year or until the next Plan is implemented in 2019.
- Ohio's Solid Waste Management Districts/Authorities: 2016 Disposal, Generation and Contract Fees
 - District has so much revenue because there are three of the largest landfills in the state.
 - District currently charges the lowest tipping fees allowed by law (\$1/ton for Inside District Waste; \$2/ton for Outside District Waste; \$1/ton for Outside State Waste). If the tipping fee were raised, some contracts may be lost to landfills in other Districts because of their lower tipping fees.
 - The highest tipping fees allowed by law are \$2/ton for Inside District Waste; \$4/ton for Outside District Waste; \$2/ton for Outside State Waste.
 - Some Districts like Cuyahoga County's don't have a landfill so they don't charge a tipping fee but instead have a generation fee (every ton of waste that is generated in Cuyahoga County has an associated fee regardless of where it is disposed).
 - The District is permitted to charge a generation fee, but it puts the burden on the businesses located within the District because they would have to pay an additional fee for the waste generated in the District as well as the typical tipping fee wherever the waste is disposed. The businesses may in turn charge an additional amount to the residents for waste hauling, so it benefits both the businesses and residents of the District not to charge a generation fee.

6. Finance Director's Report

- Estimated Revenue vs. Actual Revenue
 - General Fund total is \$38,766.81 with interest earned at \$6,642.83 and Recycling Revenue at \$32,123.98
 - Tipping Fee Fund Total is \$388,434.38 with \$95,512.35 Inside District, \$289,334.48 Outside District, and \$3,385.44 Outside State. Tipping fees look like they are down but it was just the timing because the Kimble check for January hadn't yet been received by the time this was put together
 - Total of all revenues is \$427,201.19 and 11.5 % of budget has been received.

March 3, 2017, Board of Directors Meeting Minutes cont.

➤ Budgeted vs. Actual Expenses

- General Fund Total Combined Year-to-Date Expenses is \$5,525.28, which includes Host Community Grants that exceeded the budgeted \$100,000 and the recycling of county government office bulbs, which must come out of the unrestricted monies as it is not budgeted for in the Plan.
- District Administration Total Combined Year-to-Date Expenses is \$113,172.25
- District Recycling/County Program Total Combined Year-to-Date Expenses is \$814,047.67, which is down slightly from the previous year: Yard Waste Management expenses were a little higher than last year because of the mild winter; Household Hazardous Waste Program includes the Canton Recycle Center HHW Collection and some remaining HHW Education Grant Payments; Sheriff Department Grants are paid upfront other than \$1,000 each quarter; 25% of the Health Department Grants are paid upfront
- The Tipping Fee Fund Total Combined Year-to-Date Expenses is \$927,219.92 and combined with the General Fund Total Combined Year-to-Date Expenses is \$932,745.20. The combined expended percent so far is about 16%, which is right on track because of the grants that are paid upfront.

➤ Current Cash Position

- Net loss in the Year-to-Date Grand Total All Funds of \$505,544.01, but more is always spent at beginning of the year because of upfront grants and nonrecurring expenses and the amount levels off throughout the year.

➤ 2017 Official Certificate of Estimated Resources

- Estimated \$3,712,500 in revenue and \$4,731,786 in expenses so difference will come out of the \$4,369,394 unencumbered balance.

❖ ***Resolution BOD-2017-10:*** Member Creighton moved and Member Amstutz seconded a motion to approve the 2017 Official Certificate of Estimated Resources as presented retroactive to January 1, 2017.

➤ Tipping Fee Revenue Trend

- Largest revenue is Outside District tipping fees.
- Total tipping fee revenue reached the highest point to date in 2004 at \$6,200,936
- Revenue hit the lowest point to date in 2010 at \$2,723,316 due to economic factors, acquisitions/mergers of waste companies, and other waste districts lowering their fee structure
- Current revenue is in the \$3,500,000 range, which is close to the average of just over \$4,000,000
- Tipping fees represent 92% of revenue

➤ December 31, 2016 Investment Report

- Majority of money now in managed portfolio due to high interest rate.
- Star Plus interest yield is not growing at same rate of others so District may close it and move funds into RedTree Investments or StarOhio. Reads
- Total current principal balance is \$5,455,859.90, interest earned current year-to-date is \$37,696.33, and current weighted yield is 0.915%.

7. Executive Director's Report

- Drop-off vs Curbside Recycling Tonnages (2007-2016)
 - 11 out of the 12 District municipalities have curbside recycling programs. Louisville is the only one without a program and the District has reached out to them to offer support if they move toward it.
 - The primary reason for the growth in curbside tonnages from 2013 is the switch to 65-gallon wheeled containers. Typically see a 20-30% increase in tonnage.
 - District Drop-off volume increased but weight decreased because bottles and cans are now lighter, fewer people are subscribing to newspapers, and more people are producing lighter cardboard boxes from online shopping. While very few drop-off sites have been added, the number of pickups increased significantly because of this.
- 2016 Annual District Report
 - Businesses are not required to respond to the annual district report survey but are encouraged to and those that have responded before may receive follow up correspondence if they do not. Some businesses see their waste information as proprietary.
 - Industrial businesses reported a recycling rate of about 70% primarily because metal has value.
 - Commercial businesses reported recycling rate is around 25% but the actual rate is likely much higher because not all businesses respond to survey.
 - The District must meet an access goal and not the recycling rate goal of 25% residential/commercial and 66% industrial.
- Television/CRT Collection Program
 - Television/CRT collection program at the City of Canton Recycling Center discontinued for 2017.
 - District was collecting and recycling even though it is not required and most the weight of the televisions could not be recycled.
 - There are a few businesses in the District still collecting them for a cost, but it is legal for residents to throw them away.
- Ongoing Site Improvements
 - New Philadelphia Buehler's: increased pickup frequency, increased number of containers, increased signage, increased number of cleanups, added fencing and added cameras.
 - Village of Newcomerstown/Oxford Township/Baker's IGA: removed trees/vegetation, increased number of containers, added fencing, added signage, and could add cameras if needed.
 - Mill Township: increased number of containers, added fencing and a powered gate, restricted site hours, adding signage, and adding cameras.
- 2017 Curbside Program Assessments
 - Cities of Canton and New Philadelphia both operate their own curbside waste and recycling programs and receive funding through the Recycling Makes Sense Grant Program, but it does not cover program costs.
 - The District and Ohio EPA could conduct no cost comprehensive assessments of curbside waste and recycling collection programs for 2017 and identify grant opportunities for program upgrades.
- Ohio Recycling Workshop Series: Increase Recovery, Fight Contamination (March 17, 2017)
 - District Staff and Canton and New Philadelphia representatives will attend the workshop hosted by the Ohio EPA & Recycling Partnership to learn about curbside programs and grant opportunities.

- Current Collection Method Used by City-Operated and Industry-Operated Programs
 - Industry trend is to use a truck with an automated arm to lift the container so only one driver is required. This leads to less overall cost and cuts down on lifting injuries and drivers in the streets.

8. Review 2017 District Grants

- Incentive for New Community Curbside Programs
 - If Council goes out to bid, they can show the public the cost reduction, so the District can offer a \$2,500 mini-grant just to develop and issue bid specifications even if the program isn't ultimately implemented.
 - If the program is implemented, the District can offer a \$10,000 Program Startup Grant which helps to incentivize the administration to persist despite residential complaints about containers.
 - Finally, new curbside programs are also eligible for Recycling Makes Sense Grant Funding, which incentivizes program continuation and offers from \$25-50/ton depending on their program's service level and overall recycling rate (calculated as pounds per resident).
- Program Startup Grants
 - \$150,000 available this year to assist District recycling and yard waste drop-off sites or curbside programs. Highest priority is pay-as-you-throw curbside trash and recycling programs followed by curbside yard waste programs.
 - In the past, the District has funded buckets to assist yard waste site hosts, but if any applications for this type of request are received, they may not be recommended due to changes that will be coming to the yard waste management program (discussed previously).
 - Deadline to apply is April 1, 2017. Applications will be presented at the May 5, 2017 Board Meeting upon Budget Committee review.
- Recycling and Composting Infrastructure Enhancement Grants
 - The District has awarded these in the past to Earth N Wood, Bull Country Compost and S. Slesnick Company to help process new tonnage and ensure the District's programs can continue, but the District recommendation not to award in 2017 because there are currently no identifiable recycling gaps that negatively impact the District's operation.
- The J. M. Smucker Company / OEPA Market Development Grant
 - The District sponsored the J. M. Smucker Company who was requesting \$250,000 for a custom designed and fabricated Jellies, Jams and Preserves/Glass Separator System. This would divert food and packaging waste from the landfills by allowing them to take the finished jars that are unsuitable for sale (due to mislabeling, an issue with the recipe, etc.), separate the contents from the packaging and use the products again.

❖ ***Resolution BOD-2017-11:*** Member Amstutz moved and Member Smith seconded a motion to endorse the J.M. Smucker Company application to the OEPA and agree to administer any grant funding awarded by OEPA for this project retroactive to February 3, 2017.

9. Personnel Committee Report

- The Executive Director and Finance Director report directly to the board, so the Personnel Committee completed their evaluations. The Executive Director completed the evaluations for other District staff.

10. Other Business

- Commissioner Regula suggested the District partner with the “Stop Heroin from Killing” campaign in Stark County because the gateway to addition is prescription drug abuse.

11. Adjournment

- ❖ **Resolution BOD-2017-12:** *Member Regula moved and Member Creighton seconded a motion to adjourn the meeting at 10:30am. The motion passed unanimously.*



5-5-17

Rachel Rothacher, Board Secretary

Date