



STARK-TUSCARAWAS-WAYNE JOINT SOLID WASTE MANAGEMENT DISTRICT

9918 Wilkshire Blvd NE • Bolivar, OH 44612
330-874-2258 • 800-678-9839 • 330-874-2449 FAX
www.timetorecycle.org • district@timetorecycle.org

David Held Erica Wright
Executive Director Finance Director

BOARD OF DIRECTORS MINUTES

Friday, March 2, 2018 @ 9:30am

1. Roll Call

➤ **Board Members Present:**

Chris Abbuhl, Tuscarawas County Commissioner
Janet Weir Creighton, Chairperson, Stark County Commissioner
Ann Obrecht, Wayne County Commissioner
Richard Regula, Stark County Commissioner
Joe Sciarretti, Tuscarawas County Commissioner
Sue Smail, Wayne County Commissioner

➤ **Staff Members Present:**

David Held, Executive Director
Tiffany Hupp, Administrative Coordinator
Rachel Rothacher, Board Secretary
Steve Tharp, Operations Coordinator
Erica Wright, Finance Director

➤ **Absent:**

Ron Amstutz, Wayne County Commissioner
Kerry Metzger, Tuscarawas County Commissioner
Bill Smith, Stark County Commissioner

2. Approve March 2, 2018 Board of Directors Meeting Agenda

❖ Resolution BOD-2018-12: Member Regula moved and Member Smail seconded a motion to approve the March 2, 2018 Board of Directors Agenda. The motion passed unanimously.

3. Approve January 5, 2018 Board of Directors Meeting Minutes

❖ Resolution BOD-2018-13: Member Regula moved and Member Abbuhl seconded a motion to approve the January 5, 2018 Board of Directors Meeting Minutes. The motion passed unanimously.

4. Public Speaks

➤ There were no public speaks.

5. Policy Committee Report

- Ohio EPA Non-Binding Advisory Opinion (received February 2, 2018)
- Presents Ohio EPA's determination of whether the Plan meets the requirements established by the Ohio Revised Code (ORC)

BOARD of DIRECTORS

Stark
Janet Weir Creighton
Richard Regula
Bill Smith

Tuscarawas
Chris Abbuhl
Kerry Metzger
Joe Sciarretti

Wayne
Ron Amstutz
Ann Obrecht
Sue Smail

Friday, March 2, 2018 Board of Directors Minutes cont.

- Evaluates the District's Plan with respect to the goals established in the 2009 State Solid Waste Management Plan
- Reviews the accuracy and completeness of the inventories, projections, analyses, and demonstrations required by the District Solid Waste Management Plan Format 4.0
- Key Deficiency and Solutions: Appendix L –The Plan does not demonstrate that the District meets or will meet Goal 4 of the 2009 State Plan:
 - Plan doesn't demonstrate how the District aligns its outreach and education to available infrastructure.
 - Add language articulating advertisement of drop-off programs and collections.
 - Add bullets in narrative describing available infrastructure for each target audience (such as the school recycling program for students/educators).
 - Goal 4, the 2009 State Plan requires a solid waste management plan to identify an outreach priority and describe a strategy for addressing the priority.
 - Update outreach priority. District could expand the plan on improving residential outreach for HHW to improve tonnage collected or the District could focus on social media initiative as an outreach priority and use it to promote drop-offs, collection events, and/or HHW alternatives once a month.
 - Plan doesn't demonstrate that the District followed the best practices when developing and selecting outreach programs (focus on changing behavior not just creating awareness, have measurable results to achieve, and evaluate the results to determine if the program is achieving the desired outcome)
 - Detail how the District will focus on incorporating behavior change tools for at least 3 programs.
 - Update methods of measuring success of programs that focus more on how to measure behavior change. The District can pick 2 or 3 ways that would be a method to measure effectiveness.
 - District can list in in 2024 that data collected from methods listed to measure progress will be evaluated in a study.
- District will review changes with the OEPA in April and May and then move on to the required public comment period followed by the public hearing.
- Next meeting Friday, July 13, 2018 @ 10:15am

6. Finance Director's Report

- Estimated Revenue versus Actual Revenue
 - Tipping Fee Fund is well over baseline because of the late 2017 November American Landfill payment.
- Budgeted vs Actual Expenses
 - Sheriff and Health Department Grants get payments up front
 - General Fund includes a few Host Community Grants that exceed the Plan budgeted amount of \$100k and some government and school hazardous waste removal
- Current Cash Position
 - Tipping fee loss mainly due to upfront payment of Sheriff and Health Department grants, so as year goes on this gap will close some.
- 2018 Official Certificate of Estimated Resources
 - Total Revenue is estimated around \$4,122,500
 - Estimated tipping fee revenue is \$3,830,000. Last year District received just over \$3.9 million

- \$4.4 million in expenses appropriated, so if all appropriations are expended, it leaves an unappropriated balance of \$3.8 million.

❖ **Resolution BOD-2018-14:** *Member Sciarretti moved and Member Abbuhl seconded a motion to approve the 2018 Official Certificate of Estimated Resources as presented retroactive to January 1, 2018. The motion passed unanimously.*

➤ Investment Report

- Historically more CDs in Huntington but one more to mature—yield rates were lower; can get more from managed portfolio through Red Tree.
- Closed Star Plus account because it wasn't earning as much.
- Smaller fund balance but earning more than in the past due to higher interest rates – enough to offset some District program expenses.

➤ Tipping Fee Revenue Trend

- Pink line is total tipping fees and three tiers are displayed separately as well.
- Out-of-State only taken at American Landfill, and it doesn't change much due to contracts.
- Out-of-District is what really shapes the revenue.
- Factors that Impact Waste Tonnages: Economy, waste disposal contracts, waste company acquisitions/mergers, waste district contacts and fee schedules.
- Factors to consider when discussing increasing the tipping fee tiers:
 - Other waste districts may lower their tipping fees to attract more contracts which impacts us if those districts are closer to where the waste is coming from.
 - STW District is currently at the floor with a 1-2-1 structure. If it ever got to a point where an increase was needed to sustain programs/budget in approved Plan, the increase could be explored, but it would have to be approved in the Plan and go through ratification.
 - All three rates must be increased equally, so this could negatively impact the in-district waste as hauling companies may pass along the increase to residents.

7. **Executive Director's Report**

➤ Drop-off vs Curbside Recycling Tonnages

- Curbside programs are ideal: increased participation due to increased convenience
- All but one township doesn't have curbside waste, so they don't have curbside recycling.
- Increase in curbside tonnage primarily due to communities switching to larger recyclable containers as well as limiting the amount of trash that can be placed at the curb.
- Levelling off drop-off tonnage is primarily due to reduced subscriptions for newspapers and magazines and decreased density of cans and bottles, so volume is higher, but weight is lower.
- Increase in online shopping increased amount of cardboard shipping boxes, but residents do not break them down, also contributing to increase in number of pickups but decrease in weight.

➤ 2017 Annual District Report

- Company: GT Environmental
- Survey: ~3,000 commercial and industrial businesses
- Cost: \$8,750
- OEPA Deadline: June 1, 2018

➤ 2017 Curbside Program Assessments

- City of Canton and City of New Philadelphia both have City-operated curbside waste and recycling programs with 18-gallon recycling containers and both looking to improve program cost efficiency and effectiveness
- District completed program assessments at no cost to the cities and identified grant opportunities for recommended program upgrades (automated trucks, wheeled carts, etc.).

- District previously provided the Cities funding for their current trucks/bins, which were considered state-of-the-art at the time, but automated collection with one driver is now the industry standard because it is faster and safer (drivers don't have to get out of the truck), but it requires a significant up-front investment and would probably be 3-5-year implementation once they committed to it.
- Stark County Litter Deputy
 - Deputy Chris Newman was named Stark County Sheriff's Deputy of the Year
 - Worked in the jail, civil, and operations divisions
 - Member of the honor guard since it began in 2009
 - Volunteers with various community and fundraising
 - District awards the Sheriff's Department a \$95,000 grant for illegal dumping, litter enforcement, and overweight trash trucks.
 - Deputies try to educate if residents are unaware of the law but enforce the law if it's flagrant disregard.
- Tuscarawas County Litter Program
 - Tuscarawas County Litter Deputy found several bags of dumped garbage in Warren Township that included a piece of mail including the responsible party's address; responsible party's identity confirmed, and they were cited for illegal dumping.
 - The District also had dumping issues at a drop-off site and partnered with the Sheriff's Office to use social media to help find responsible party; overall a success and helpful tool.

8. 2018 District Newsletter Printing RFP

- Requests for Proposals were sent out January 29, 2018, and the District received only one bid (other companies did not submit primarily because they knew they wouldn't be competitive).
- This price includes the paper, but paper prices have been increasing in the market for each month for the past six months, so the District should have Hess purchase the paper now to secure the proposed rate instead of waiting until July; otherwise, the final cost may be higher than the proposed amount.
 - ❖ **Resolution BOD-2018-15:** *Member Smail moved and Member Obrecht seconded a motion to authorize the Executive Director to enter into an agreement with Hess Print Solutions for the printing and mailing of the 2018 Recycling Newsletter for an amount not to exceed \$75,000. The motion passed unanimously.*

9. 2018 Yard Waste Collection Program

- The past has demonstrated the District should not over-expand infrastructure during a good market as it may not be sustainable:
 - In Stark County, District previously decreased from 15 to ten sites and at least two will be dropping out this year.
 - There are also other sites in Tuscarawas County that aren't listed because they are not open for all District residents; therefore, they are not eligible for funding.
- The market for yard waste is currently saturated due to pipeline construction and demand is down due to closure of a facility in Coshocton that used to receive truckloads a day.
- Ultimately, the District could move toward the closure of all community collection sites and guide residents directly to the compost facilities that process, but a transition is needed.
- The proposal distributes Block Grants to 11 sites based upon their 2017 tonnage per site and the amount of funding available in the budget for the program
 - Plain township had two sites and will still have one, but they also have a larger population, so their funding level was adjusted.

- Sites will be looking at volume restricting measures like restricting hours by using gates or even restricting collection months or materials (seasonal leaf collection).
- ❖ **Resolution BOD-2018-16:** *Member Regula moved and Member Obrecht seconded a motion to approve the 2018 Yard Waste Block Grants up the amounts presented for a total funding amount of \$382,753. The motion passed unanimously.*

10. Review 2018 District Grants

a) Program Startup Grants

- \$250,000 appropriated in 2018
- Political subdivisions are eligible, and priority is as follows: pay-as-you-throw, curbside, then drop-off programs.
- Projects can include equipment, maintenance costs, etc. with developing/modifying a program.
- Deadline to apply is April 1, 2019; applications will be presented at the May 4, 2018 Board Meeting.

b) Host Community Cleanup Grant

- ❖ **Resolution BOD-2018-17:** *Member Obrecht moved Member Smail seconded a motion to approve Chippewa Township (Wayne County) for a 2018 Host Community Cleanup Grant for \$2,500. The motion passed unanimously.*

c) The Belden Brick Company / OEPA Market Development Grant

- Districts administers the OEPA Market Development Grant.
- Grant Request: \$150,000
- Project: Dry Grinding Attritor to size and condition various waste byproduct additives to the brickmaking process.
- Submitted: February 1, 2018.
- ❖ **Resolution BOD-2018-18:** *Member Abbuhl moved and Member Sciarretti seconded a motion to endorse The Belden Brick Company Market Development Grant application to the Ohio EPA and agree to administer any grant funding awarded by Ohio EPA for this project retroactive to February 1, 2018. The motion passed unanimously.*

11. Personnel Committee Report

- 2018 Personnel Committee is comprised of Commissioner Janet Weir Creighton (Stark), Commissioner Ann Obrecht (Wayne) and Commissioner Joe Sciarretti (Tuscarawas).
- Finance and Executive Directors report directly to the Board and must be evaluated annually. Evaluations were completed at the February 23, 2018 meeting.

12. Other Business

- There was no other business.

13. Adjournment

- ❖ **Resolution BOD-2018-19:** *Member Regula moved and Member Sciarretti seconded a motion to adjourn the meeting at 10:42 am. The motion passed unanimously.*



5-4-17

Rachel Rothacher, Board Secretary

Date